

1

Identify the Claim

What is the quote saying?

Students begin by interpreting the quote as clearly as possible. The goal is not to agree or disagree, but to articulate the strongest version of the idea the quote is expressing.

At this stage, students:

- paraphrase the quote in their own words
- respond to a discussion prompt inviting students to think of a time in their lives where this claim held true.

Teaching note: Emphasise that the claim is not the student's opinion. It is the best possible reading of the quote's message.

**2**

Construct a Counter-Claim

What is a reasonable challenge to this idea?

Students then develop a counterclaim that questions, limits, or complicates the original claim. A good counterclaim does not attack the quote or dismiss its intent; instead, it introduces a legitimate alternative perspective.

At this stage, students:

- intentionally disagree with the claim and propose a counterclaim
- respond to a discussion prompt inviting students to think of a time in their lives where this counterclaim held true.

Teaching note: Frame counterclaims as an act of intellectual generosity. The aim is to strengthen thinking, not to "win" an argument.

**3**

Pose an Essential Question

What deeper question does this tension raise?

Rather than resolving the disagreement, students use the tension between claim and counterclaim to generate an open-ended essential question. This question should not have a single correct answer and should invite ongoing reflection and discussion.

At this stage, students:

- use the tension and their own confusion and /or curiosity to come up with a question (The question is likely to draw on their beliefs and real-world contexts.)

Teaching note: Resist closing the discussion too neatly. The essential question is meant to stay open and travel beyond the lesson.